

THE ASPEN INSTITUTE

ASPEN IDEAS FESTIVAL 2008

THURSDAY, JULY 3, 2008

PARTICIPANTS:

TYNE DALY
Stage and Screen Actress

PAUL COLLIER
Professor of Economics
Director, Centre for the Study of African Economies

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

P R O C E E D I N G S

MS. DALY: Good afternoon. My name is Tyne Daly
and --

(Applause)

MS. DALY: Thank you. It falls to me this
afternoon to be an interval. Now, I have never been an
interval before. I've done a lot of things in 47 years of
talking to folks, but I think mainly this is a chance for
people to go and have a break. So I have been in rooms
where the audience just streamed out of the room, certain
productions that I hesitate to name.

At any rate, I have two offerings today. And
for those of you who need a break please take it, and for
those of you who want to stay, thank you. I was trying to
think of what will be appropriate to do in this setting.
I'm going to read two poems, unless the first one goes
very badly, and then I will quit after the first one.

But it -- they seemed to me they are old friends
of mine, both these pieces, and it seemed to me that
perhaps they would be appropriate to this setting. This
is number 65 from a collection called, *The People, Yes* by

1 Carl Sandburg.

2 The mazuma, the jack, the shekels, the kale, the
3 velvet, the you-know-what, the what-it-takes, a roll, a
4 wad. Bring it home, boy. Bring home the bacon. Start on
5 a shoestring if you have to. Then get your first million.
6 The second million is always easier than the first.

7 And if you get more of them round the iron men
8 than you can use you can always throw them at the birds;
9 it's been done.

10 Now take some men, everything they touch turns
11 into money, they know how the land lays, they can smell
12 where the dollars grow.

13 Money withers if you don't know how to nurse it
14 along. Money flies away if you don't know where to put
15 it. The first question is, where do we raise the money,
16 where the cash coming from? A little horse sense helps,
17 an idea and horse sense take you far. If you got a scheme
18 ask yourself, will it work?

19 And let me put one bug in your ear, inside
20 information helps. How many fortunes came from a tip,
21 from being on the ground first, from hearing a piece of
22 news, from fast riding, early buying, quick selling or

1 plain dumb luck?

2 Yes, get Lady Luck with you and you're made.
3 Some fortunes were tumbled into and the tumblers at first
4 said, who would believe it? And later I knew just how
5 they do it.

6 Yes, Lady Luck counts. Before you are born,
7 pick the right papa and mama and the newsreel boys will be
8 on the premises early for shot of you with your toe in
9 your mouth.

10 Money is power, so said one. Money is a
11 cushion, so said another. Money is the root of evil, so
12 said still another. Money means freedom, so runs an old
13 saying.

14 And money is all of these and more. Money pays
15 for whatever you want -- if you have the money. Money
16 buys clothes, food, houses, land, guns, jewels, men,
17 women, time to be lazy and to listen to music.

18 Money buys everything except love, personality,
19 freedom, immortality, silence, peace. Therefore, men
20 fight for money. Therefore men steal, kills, swindle,
21 walks as hypocrites and whited sepulchers. Therefore men
22 speak softly carrying plans, poisons, weapons, each in the

1 design. The words of his mouth were as butter but war was
2 in his heart.

3 Therefore nations lay strange holds on each
4 other; bombardments open, tanks advanced, salients are
5 seized, aviators walk on air; truckloads of amputated arms
6 and legs are hauled away.

7 Money is power, freedom, a cushion, the root of
8 all evil, the sum of blessings. Tell us what is money,
9 for we are ignorant of money, its ways and meanings, each
10 a child in a dark storm where people cry for money. Where
11 the carcass is the buzzards gather. Where the treasure is
12 the heart is also. Money breeds money. Money runs the
13 world. Money talk is bigger than talk talk. No ear is
14 deaf to the song that gold sings.

15 Money is welcome even when it stinks. Money is
16 the sinew of love and of war. Money breaks men and ruins
17 women. Money is a great comfort. Every man has his
18 price. There are men who can't be bought. There are
19 women beyond purchase. When you buy judges someone sells
20 justice. You can buy anything except day and night.

21 (Applause)

22 MS. DALY: I do love poets, and so I'm going to

1 try the second one, okay. This is from a woman named
2 Naomi Newman. It's not a poem per se, but it's a lovely
3 piece, and I like it. It's from a theatrical piece called
4 *Snake Talk: Urgent Messages from the Mother Line*
5 *(phonetic)*.

6 This is a vaguely titled the oy vey path.
7 Anybody in the room that understands the oy vey path?

8 Enough of the oy vey path. Now we are going to
9 fix it. Now we make a new-way path. So, you take a
10 shovel, you take a ground hacker, you take a hairpin. If
11 all you got is a hairpin, take a hairpin and start
12 digging. Dig in all directions, up and down, left and
13 right, in and out, not a straight line. Nothing natural
14 or interesting goes into a straight-line.

15 As a matter of fact, it is the quickest way to
16 the wrong place. And don't try to pretend you know where
17 you are going. Because if you know where you are going
18 you have been there, and so you are going to end up
19 exactly where you came from.

20 Okay. So, now we are digging. All of a sudden
21 you bump into a stone. Oh, it's so cute. Un-uh. Throw
22 it away like a hot potato. You are going to bump into

1 lots of stones, geologically fascinating; stone of blame,
2 resentment, self-pity. Oooh, from these I could build a
3 palace. Forget it. You build from them, what you got is
4 a prison. So you have bend down, you pick them up, you
5 throw them away. Dig a little, pick a little throw a
6 little, turn; dig a little, pick a little, throw a little,
7 turn.

8 Now, this is where you got to pay special
9 attention to getting lost. If you are not lost, you are
10 in trouble. Lost? Good. Sit down, blown your nose, and
11 wait. Sometimes you got to wait for a very long time.
12 Until a bird or a stranger comes along with a message.
13 And do you know what you are supposed to do while you are
14 waiting. You are supposed to do nothing. Nada, zilch,
15 nothing. And if you can do that, if you can do nothing
16 until the right thing comes along, then you have mastered
17 the hardest part of all.

18 Okay. So now you are back on the road, nice and
19 easy, no rush, no push, and you take one little step, you
20 take two little steps, you take three little steps, you
21 take -- watch out! Watch out! You are about to fall into
22 the puddle of empty manifestation. Here on the fourth

1 step you are meant to fall down, not once, not twice, not
2 occasionally, but on every fourth step. The ground opens,
3 the wind blows, a branch hits you in the head, you trip on
4 stones, you twist your ankle, your heartbreaks, you've got
5 a fold the laundry and they have closed the two left
6 lanes.

7 All the forces gathered together to stop you.
8 And some people, when it happens, they fall down and they
9 lie there for the rest of their lives. But some people
10 learn how to fall down and get up. Now, that's one move,
11 fall down and get up.

12 Okay, so now you are on your own way and you
13 noticed that with every step you straighten up little bit.
14 And it hurts. All of the places that you've been bending
15 over that got stuck. And don't try to avoid it hurting,
16 because if you do, you will never straighten up.

17 Okay, that's it. That's how you do it. You
18 dig, you bend down, you throw away, you go in circles, you
19 get lost, you wait, you listen, you do nothing, you fall
20 down, get up, and inside, you unfold.

21 (Applause)

22

1 XXX BEGIN TRACK 2

2

3 MR. COLLIER: My name is Paul Collier. And I
4 keep landing myself with nightmare situations like
5 following an act like that. I'm here because I wrote a
6 book called *The Bottom Billion*. *The Bottom Billion* is a
7 book that you can read on a beach. And I know that many
8 people have done just that. But it's -- although it's a
9 light read, it's about a serious subject.

10 It's about 60 or so countries that have missed
11 out on the unprecedented economic prosperity of the last
12 40 years, and essentially stagnated. Those 60 countries
13 have about a billion people living in them. They are the
14 bottom billion. And over the last 30 or 40 years that
15 bottom billion people, because they have stagnated, have
16 diverged from the rest of mankind.

17 Already by the millennium the gap between the
18 billion at the bottom and the -- even the next four
19 billion before we get to the lucky billion at the top, the
20 gap was five to one and it's been widening at 5 percent a
21 year. If history continues like that, if the next 40
22 years is like the past 40 years we'll have two things.

1 One is, we'll have a human tragedy of an enormous scale.
2 A billion people living in societies that don't offer
3 credible hope. And that's the difference between somebody
4 who is, say, poor in China and poor in Chad. You can be
5 poor in China, but you have got a reasonable prospect that
6 your children will grow up as part of the modern world.
7 And poor in Chad and you don't have that credible prospect
8 for your kids.

9 So it's a human tragedy, but it's also, I
10 believe, a looming nightmare. Are you safe? Will you be
11 safe? Is homeland security going to save you? I think
12 not. In fact, what homeland security reminds me of is
13 what America did in 1919. It come out of a nightmare
14 First World War, which didn't resolve problems, it left a
15 heap of problems lurking. But they were amorphous risks.

16 And in 1919 at the Treaty of Versailles
17 politicians pretended that they'd fix the problem. They
18 could pretend that because the risks were amorphous, and
19 they didn't blowup for quite a while. But eventually they
20 did.

21 The generation got slaughtered, the biggest
22 catastrophe in human history, because those risks were not

1 properly faced. To its enormous credit, in 1948, after
2 the Second World War, America did face the risks. It did
3 something. It got serious about strategies for reducing
4 risks. After the First World War the strategy had been
5 analogous to homeland security. It had been isolationism.
6 After the Second World War, America got serious and used
7 the entire waterfront of policies to rebuild Europe, which
8 at that time was the core of the risk problem. They were
9 fragile states in Central Europe tumbling one-by-one into
10 the Soviet empire which had nuclear rockets.

11 And so you knew you had to get serious. And you
12 did. You had a huge aid program, Marshall Aid, but you
13 went well beyond aid. You totally reversed your trade
14 policy, opened your markets to Europe. You totally
15 reversed your security policy. You had over a hundred
16 thousand troops in Europe for over 40 years. And you
17 totally reversed your attitudes towards the governance of
18 other countries.

19 After the First World War it had been total
20 noninterference. You wouldn't even join the League of
21 Nations. After the Second World War, you found the United
22 Nations, you found the Organization for Economic Co-

1 operation and Development. You found the International
2 Monetary Fund. You encouraged Europe to form the European
3 Community. That's still the waterfront of policies; aid,
4 trade, security, governances. Of course the problem is
5 different. What is the problem? It's that, if the next
6 40 years is like the last 40 years and these 60 countries
7 continue to stagnate, they won't all literally stagnate,
8 some will fall apart.

9 You can't predict which ones. I'll remind you
10 why you have such a big homeland security force now. It's
11 because there was a failing state called Afghanistan,
12 which provided a safe haven for terrorism. And failing
13 states provides safe havens, not just for terrorism, but
14 for international crime, for disease.

15 You cannot envisage a world that is safe and
16 that has 60 countries stagnating, some of them
17 unpredictably falling into the trap of being a fatal
18 state. In the Bottom Billion, I set out what I think is a
19 feasible agenda, a long (inaudible) waterfront of aid,
20 trade, security and governance, which would, I think, make
21 a huge difference to the problem. The problem with the
22 bottom billion is a much more fixable problem than some of

1 the huge problems that have been tackled since the Second
2 World War. But today I want to move beyond the bottom
3 billion. And I want to look because the security crisis
4 is a sort of slow nightmare. I want to look at some here-
5 and-now issues, in fact some issues that I didn't
6 anticipate when I wrote *The Bottom Billion*, which was not
7 that long ago. I want to look at two here-and-now
8 nightmares and two here-and-now opportunities. And let me
9 start with the here-and-now nightmares.

10 In fact let me start with the nightmare of the
11 last week. And the nightmare of the last week is
12 Zimbabwe. One of the traps that I think the bottom
13 billion fall into is gross misgovernance. And, of course,
14 Zimbabwe over the last few years fell into that trap.

15 There was an election. There was a lot of
16 international excitement about the election. And I didn't
17 get excited, because in these societies elections are not
18 about a choice of government, they are a process of
19 reanointing an established leader. And that's what you've
20 have just witnessed, the reanointment through the massacre
21 of a democratic process of an established leader who is
22 prepared to use extreme violence in order to stay in

1 power. Now, what can we do about situations like that,
2 about thugs staying in power? This is not a new
3 situation, it's something that for thousands of years
4 rulers have learnt and occasionally adopted the
5 technologies of extreme repression in order to retain
6 power.

7 How can they be dislodged? If they are not too
8 cruel they can be dislodged by mass public protest. But
9 if the dictator is sufficiently cruel, mass public protest
10 doesn't work. There is the only one way of dislodging
11 dictators, and that is force, if they are prepared to be
12 so cruel as to crush civilian protest.

13 Now, both the left and the right kind of agree
14 that extreme violent dictators have to be faced down by
15 force, but they looked to different solutions to do that.
16 And I think both are actually implausible solutions. Of
17 course the solution of the right, we know what that is,
18 it's external, in military intervention, its invasion.

19 I suspect that the international community has
20 rather lost its appetite for that as a solution to the
21 petty dictators of this world. Nobody is going to invade
22 Zimbabwe. Mugabe is quite safe from external military

1 intervention. So much for the right. What about the
2 left? Well, the left over the last 40 or 50 years has
3 also looked to a military solution in extreme cases and
4 its military solution has been armed struggle, rebellion.
5 You arm -- you build a private army and you fight to crush
6 the dictator.

7 A lot of my work over recent years has been to
8 argue that that is a disastrous route. And it usually
9 fails. The success rate of these rebellions is pretty
10 small. It's about 20 percent. But the cost of the
11 process is astronomic. A typical civil war goes on for
12 something like a decade. It's development in reverse. It
13 destroys the economy. It destroys the society.

14 In fact most of the costs of a Civil War accrue
15 not even during the Civil War, but after it, because the
16 legacy is so awful. Even the political legacy of civil
17 war is usually a nightmare. The legacy of a civil war is
18 greatly enhanced risk of another civil war.

19 So I think neither the strategy of the right,
20 nor the strategy of the left offers us realistic prospects
21 of dislodging these cruel dictators, what's left? But I
22 think there is one thing that is left, cruel dictators all

1 depend upon an internal structure of military force. And
2 I believe the trick we have to learn how to play is to
3 turn that internal military force against the dictator.
4 The language is coup d'état. Coup d'état don't have a
5 great record, the one thing you can say in their favor is
6 that they are whole lot cheaper than a civil war, all
7 right. They are kind of surgical strike for a change of
8 regime.

9 But their record is not very good. There is
10 likely to dislodge a democratic government as a bad
11 government. And one coup tends to lead to another coup.
12 In fact coups are unguided missiles. But perhaps we need
13 to try and provide those unguided missiles with a guidance
14 system.

15 In recent years the international community has
16 really taken the view, we don't want coups at any prices.
17 And I think that's unrealistic when faced with the
18 intractable situations like Zimbabwe. And so I believe in
19 Zimbabwe. And similarly in Burma, the international
20 community actually needs to encourage a coup but a bounded
21 coup.

22 First, how can we encourage it, and then how can

1 we put some bounds on it? I believe in the -- what we
2 should be doing is, all the countries that are democratic
3 should simultaneously, temporarily withdraw recognition
4 from the government. Simultaneously, it sends a signal
5 temporary derecognition for two reasons.

6 One is if the strategy doesn't work you don't
7 accumulate a load of unrecognized states which will be a
8 problem, but above all a temporary derecognition sends a
9 signal to the military within the country that it's now or
10 never.

11 Of course dictators realize that they run a risk
12 of a coup. They do a lot to try and stop it. That's what
13 military intelligence is about. But they can't stop it.
14 On average in the last 50 years there have been about two
15 successful coup d'état a year, and that's because a coup
16 doesn't just have to come from the chief of staff, all
17 right. The president (inaudible) appoints his brother or
18 his cousin as chief of staff. But coups can come all the
19 way down the (inaudible). And as you go further down the
20 (inaudible) is increasingly disaffected in these states
21 that are falling apart economically as Zimbabwe is.

22 So what I would like to see is a process of

1 coordinated temporary derecognition. And how do we put
2 some bounds on the coup if it occurs. I believe we should
3 recognize the resulting coup. Let's say you've got 6
4 months to hold free and fair elections, are there
5 presidents for that? Yes, there are actually recent
6 presidents even in Africa.

7 Mauritania, the military came in, announced that
8 it would stay there 6 months, hold a clean election. The
9 people -- the coup leaders would not be candidates. They
10 held an election, they withdrew. It actually cleaned up
11 the government of Mauritania. So much for nightmare
12 number 1.

13 Let me turn to nightmare number 2. Nightmare
14 number 1 was last week's nightmare. Nightmare number 2 is
15 last month's nightmare. So you've probably forgotten
16 about it, but it's called the food crisis.

17 World food prices have increased enormously.
18 That's an inconvenience to you. But it's a nightmare to
19 one group of people, and that is the urban poor of Africa,
20 and a few other developing countries. Why urban, because
21 the urban population has to buy its food.

22 The rural population grows it, and so is to an

1 extent protected. But the urban population buys its food.
2 Urban poor, the poor not only have a lot less money but
3 they have a much higher share of their budget going on
4 food. At the low income levels of urban poverty half of
5 the budget is spent on food. So the urban poor of Africa
6 and who is at the bottom of the food chain. It's not just
7 the urban poor; it's the children of the urban poor.

8 Now, one thing we know from studies of nutrition
9 is that if children are malnourished for more than a
10 couple of years the effects are permanent. They're called
11 stunting. Unfortunately, we now know that stunting is not
12 merely a physical condition. It's also a mental
13 condition. The lack of nutrition does irreversible mental
14 damage. That's the situation that urban Africa is now in
15 as the result of the enormous increase in global food
16 prices.

17 The current projection for global food prices is
18 that they will stay high for years. If those projections
19 are right, we're building a generation of impaired urban
20 Africans, both physically and mentally, who will be with
21 the world for 70 or 80 years.

22 We have to bring food prices down, global food

1 prices. This is not just a matter of growing more food in
2 Africa, though that's part of it. The urban population of
3 Africa is fed from world food supplies. And so it has to
4 be a world solution.

5 My idea here is that we have a mutual de-
6 escalation of folly between America and Europe. And a
7 mutual de-escalation of folly, and food production would I
8 believe bring food prices down a lot. You in America have
9 got a folly. We in Europe have got a folly. Actually we
10 each scorn each other's folly, but cling desperately onto
11 our own. So first let me describe your folly, and then I
12 will describe ours. Your folly is biofuels.

13 (Applause)

14 MR. COLLIER: The best that can be said for the
15 American production of biofuels is that you are rich
16 enough to be able to afford folly, all right. Even in
17 energy terms the American production of biofuels makes no
18 sense, all right. It takes 10 units of energy to generate
19 11 units of energy with biofuels, but of course the guys
20 who produce the 11 at the cost of the 10 run away with the
21 subsidy on only 11, not on the 1.

22 (Applause)

1 MR. COLLIER: Why are you doing it? You know,
2 why you are doing it, because your brilliant agricultural
3 lobby, which is one of the most defective subsidy hunters
4 on earth, has scared you. How has it scared you? It's
5 fed you lies about dependency upon imported oil, the lie
6 being that biofuels will reduce that. All right. You've
7 been fed lies.

8 What's the European folly? The European folly
9 is a ban on genetically modified crops. Because of that
10 ban which came in 1996, two things have happened. One is
11 European agricultural output has gradually fallen behind
12 American outputs at about a rate of 1.5 to 2 percent a
13 year. That has reduced world food supply.

14 But a more serious effect is that African
15 governments have also banned GM, because Europe banned GM.
16 Partly they think if Europe bans it, it can't be safe, but
17 also they know that if they let GM in they will never be
18 able to export to Europe, and some of them hope at some
19 stage to do so.

20 And so every African country other than South
21 Africa has banned GM. Africa needs all the modification
22 of crops it can get. Its climate is deteriorating now.

1 Climate change for Africa is not something that's
2 happening in the future, it's happening now. The staple
3 crop of Southern Africa, maize, may become unviable in
4 Southern Africa unless we can rapidly introduce more
5 drought resistant varieties.

6 There are huge opportunities for big increases
7 in food supply. For example, still with maize, a third of
8 the world's maize crop gets destroyed in storage by
9 fungus. It's possible through genetic modification to
10 pretty well kill that fungal process.

11 Why did Europe adopt the ban on GM? Because it
12 too was fed lies. What was the lie in Europe? It was
13 that genetic modification is unsafe for your health. That
14 played upon a health scare in Europe over BSE. You're not
15 dead, are you? Right? You've been eating it for quite a
16 long time, this GM stuff.

17 So just to summarize there, both American
18 citizens and Europeans have been fed lies. Because we
19 have been fed lies, African children won't be fed enough
20 to avoid irreversible nutritional damage. We must face
21 these agricultural lobbies down to avoid a here-and-now
22 nightmare. So that's the -- that's last month's nightmare

1 which you'll -- as I say, you'll have forgotten about.

2 Now let me turn to something a bit more upbeat.

3 (Laughter)

4 MR. COLLIER: And turn to two here-and-now
5 opportunities. And the first opportunity is the commodity
6 booms. The commodity booms are potentially the best news
7 that has happened for the bottom billion in a long time.
8 It's pumping huge amounts of money into about half of the
9 countries of the bottom billion, but that happened on a
10 smaller scale 30 years ago, and it was a missed
11 opportunity.

12 In the short term it produces growth, in the
13 long term, unless you get a set of key decisions right, it
14 just produces a disaster, and that's what happened. There
15 are five decision points which between them determine
16 whether these resource revenues are harnessed for growth.

17 Back in February, I spoke to Ted -- perhaps some
18 of you in the audience would've seen the video -- and I
19 spoke about one of the decision points, which was how you
20 sell the rights to resource extraction. And I suggested
21 that the right way to do it was simply through auctions,
22 because auctions get around the problem of corruption.

1 And they get around the problem that the government hasn't
2 a clue what these things are worth, whereas the companies
3 know. Today I want to move to decision point two. So the
4 decision point one, let's suppose we sold the rights
5 through an auction.

6 The next step, which is actually a very
7 important step, is that governments should tax a
8 reasonable amount of the revenues coming into these
9 companies from resource extraction. And at the moment the
10 story is all over the place, but generally scandalous.
11 I'll give you one example, Democratic Republic of the
12 Congo. The Democratic Republic of the Congo is to
13 democratic republics what up is to down.

14 (Laughter)

15 MR. COLLIER: But it does have a lot of resource
16 extraction, of minerals, and they have a sort of tax
17 regime which is royalty payment system. The royalty
18 payments into the treasury of the DRC over the last year
19 totaled \$86,000. That's not a lot, considering how many
20 hundreds of millions of dollars were exported. In other
21 words, the tax regime is hopelessly, absurdly, inadequate.

22 I could give you other examples. I'll give one

1 other, which is just being revised, which is Zambia.
2 Copper exports of \$2 billion, copper tax revenues \$36
3 million. If they'd have the same tax regime as Chile, the
4 revenues would have been more like \$800 million. So these
5 ridiculous tax regimes are sort of Africa's aid program to
6 America and Europe, and they need to be revised.

7 I'm trying to get a set of five voluntary
8 international standards which would just highlight these
9 decision points. They are very simple to do. So one of
10 the standards would be adopt sensible tax regimes. But 5
11 years into the biggest commodity boom in history we
12 haven't got any of them.

13 Let me turn to the last new opportunity, and in
14 many ways it's the most exciting. There's been three
15 generations of institutional response to the problems of
16 the bottom billion over the last 50 years. And the first
17 one was the big public institutions like the World Bank
18 and the United Nations. And they were the appropriate
19 response for their time. But over time they've kind of
20 ossified their big bureaucracies -- I wouldn't want to
21 call them dinosaurs, but they're yesterday's solution to
22 today's problem. The second generation of response was

1 the sort of compassion. NGOs, things like Oxfam. And
2 that compassion was an enormous force for good, but often
3 the balance between the heart and the head wasn't right.

4 And now we've got a new generation of response
5 which is social entrepreneurship, social philanthropy.
6 And this is really exciting, because it's got all the
7 compassion of the second wave, plus, it's got some
8 business expertise, some business knows. And so kids out
9 of business school with an MBA with all the compassion of
10 my own 1968 generation, but with more sense. That's the
11 exciting new wave.

12 And to date fine as that wave has been, I think
13 it's not been harnessed properly, because paradoxically
14 this new wave has failed to think strategically about what
15 interventions might scale up. And the opportunities that
16 could scale up differ according to the challenges faced by
17 different countries of the bottom billion.

18 And I want to close with one example. To date,
19 the social entrepreneurship has focused overwhelmingly on
20 micro credit. That's all right. But we need to move well
21 beyond that, because often in these countries what is
22 missing is skill sets of entrepreneurship not just

1 finance. The most troubled places on earth are the
2 countries which are landlocked and resource-scarce. These
3 are the countries that probably shouldn't have been
4 countries, but they are.

5 It's very hard to think what the opportunities
6 for landlocked resource-scarce countries might be. But
7 there is one new opportunity and that is e-services, okay.
8 E-services can often be quite humble like call centers.
9 Of course, one country has made an enormous success of
10 exporting e-services, that's India. In fact, so
11 successful has India been that its costs are now rising,
12 and so call centers are shifting out of India into places
13 like the Philippines.

14 But India is not landlocked, the Philippines are
15 not landlocked. They've got other opportunities. What we
16 need to do is get social entrepreneurs to take things like
17 call centers, e-services into the small countries of the
18 bottom billion and try and show that they can be
19 profitable. And then if they are profitable they'll scale
20 up.

21 Twenty five years ago one entrepreneur took
22 garments industry to Bangladesh. That enterprise scaled

1 up. In fact, after the first year half the labor force
2 left and setup their own garment companies. There is now
3 2.5 million people employed in the garment industry in
4 Bangladesh. We need that sort of process for call centers
5 in the landlocked resource-scarce countries of the bottom
6 billion.

7 And now let me draw to a close. I wrote *The*
8 *Bottom Billion* as a book that could be read on the beach
9 for a very simple reason. Of course, as an economist it
10 was social death, because economists really write for each
11 other rather than for anybody else. But I wrote it
12 because I realized that the sort of ideas I've sketched,
13 today, if you think about them, they don't even cost a lot
14 of money. They're no more expensive than dumb policies.

15 (Laughter)

16 MR. COLLIER: And yet what we've got is the dumb
17 policies. And I realized why? You've got dumb policies
18 whilst (inaudible) politicians can get away with them.
19 Gesture politics is easier than serious politics.
20 Politicians will get away with gesture politics whilst
21 (inaudible) citizens are so badly informed that they go
22 along with it. And so I realized it was vital to build a

1 critical mass of informed citizens here in America and
2 also in Europe.

3 Please, if you've taken some hold of the few
4 ideas I have a chance to sketch today, read *The Bottom*
5 *Billion*, read it on a beach, if you like. If you agree
6 with some of those ideas, please become ambassadors for
7 them. Thank you very much.

8 (Applause)

9 SPEAKER: Thank you.

10 (Whereupon, the PROCEEDINGS were adjourned.)

11

* * * * *